



Maria Yuliana <mariayuliana@ukwms.ac.id>

Submission Confirmation

1 message

Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering <em@editorialmanager.com>
Reply-To: Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering <support@elsevier.com>
To: Maria Yuliana <mariayuliana@ukwms.ac.id>

Thu, May 19, 2022 at 10:28 AM

Ms. Ref. No.:

Title: POLYSTYRENE-TEMPLATED HOLLOW MESOPOROUS MAGNETITE AS A BIFUNCTIONAL ADSORBENT FOR THE REMOVAL OF RHODAMINE B VIA SIMULTANEOUS ADSORPTION AND DEGRADATION
Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering
Research Paper

Dear Dr. Maria Yuliana,

We have received your article "POLYSTYRENE-TEMPLATED HOLLOW MESOPOROUS MAGNETITE AS A BIFUNCTIONAL ADSORBENT FOR THE REMOVAL OF RHODAMINE B VIA SIMULTANEOUS ADSORPTION AND DEGRADATION" for consideration for publication in Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering.

Your manuscript will be given a reference number once an editor has been assigned.

To track the status of your paper, please do the following:

1. Go to this URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/jece/>
2. Log in as an Author
3. Click [Submissions Being Processed]

Thank you for submitting your work to this journal.

Kind regards,

Editorial Manager
Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering

Please note that the editorial process varies considerably from journal to journal. For more information about the submission-to-publication lifecycle, click here: http://help.elsevier.com/app/answers/detail/p/7923/a_id/160

For further assistance, please visit our customer support site at <http://help.elsevier.com/app/answers/list/p/7923>. Here you can search for solutions on a range of topics, find answers to frequently asked questions and learn more about EM via interactive tutorials. You will also find our 24/7 support contact details should you need any further assistance from one of our customer support representatives.

#AU_JECE#

To ensure this email reaches the intended recipient, please do not delete the above code

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/jece/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.



Maria Yuliana <mariayuliana@ukwms.ac.id>

Your Submission - JECE-D-22-04236

1 message

Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering <em@editorialmanager.com>

Mon, May 30, 2022 at 11:53 PM

Reply-To: Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering <support@elsevier.com>

To: Maria Yuliana <mariayuliana@ukwms.ac.id>

Ms. Ref. No.: JECE-D-22-04236

Title: POLYSTYRENE-TEMPLATED HOLLOW MESOPOROUS MAGNETITE AS A BIFUNCTIONAL ADSORBENT FOR THE REMOVAL OF RHODAMINE B VIA SIMULTANEOUS ADSORPTION AND DEGRADATION

Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering

Dear Dr. Yuliana,

Thank you for submitting the above paper to Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering. Your manuscript needs major revisions.

The reviewers comments are included below for your attention. Please carefully address the issues raised in the comments. I invite you to submit your revised manuscript.

The due date for submitting your revised manuscript is Jun 29, 2022

NOTE: Upon submitting your revised manuscript, please upload the source files for your article. We cannot accommodate PDF manuscript files for production purposes. We also ask that when submitting your revision, you follow the journal formatting guidelines. For additional details regarding acceptable file formats, please refer to the Guide for Authors at: <http://www.elsevier.com/journals/<slugified journal title>/<issn>/guide-for-authors>

If you are submitting a revised manuscript, please also:

a) outline each change made (point by point) as raised in the reviewer comments

AND

b) provide a suitable rebuttal to each reviewer comment not addressed

In order to facilitate the check of your manuscript, all the changes made during revision should appear in a different color. That is, the font color should be changed from black to red or blue (directly in the text) rather than using the track changes in Microsoft Word. A response letter for the revised manuscript should be sent to the editor along with your responses to the reviewer comments. These two steps are mandatory for the further review of the manuscript.

To submit your revision, please do the following:

1. Go to: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/jece/>
2. Enter your login details
3. Click [Author Login]
This takes you to the Author Main Menu.
4. Click [Submissions Needing Revision]

PDFs are not acceptable revised manuscript files. Please prepare your manuscript text (with author details), tables, figure legends and any acknowledgements as a single Word file. Please prepare your Figures in an approved format (TIFF, EPS or MS Office files) with the correct resolution. Prepare any supporting information such as 'Response to Reviewers' as a separate Word file.

NOTE: Upon submitting your revised manuscript, please upload the source files for your article. For additional details

regarding acceptable file formats, please refer to the Guide for Authors at: <http://www.elsevier.com/journals/journal-of-environmental-chemical-engineering/2213-3437/guide-for-authors>

When submitting your revised paper, we ask that you include the following items:

Manuscript and Figure Source Files (mandatory)

We cannot accommodate PDF manuscript files for production purposes. We also ask that when submitting your revision you follow the journal formatting guidelines. Figures and tables may be embedded within the source file for the submission as long as they are of sufficient visual quality. For any figure that cannot be embedded within the source file (such as *.PSD Photoshop files), the original figure needs to be uploaded separately. Refer to the Guide for Authors for additional information.

Highlights (optional)

Highlights consist of a short collection of bullet points that convey the core findings of the article and should be submitted in a separate file in the online submission system. Please use 'Highlights' in the file name and include 3 to 5 bullet points (maximum 85 characters, including spaces, per bullet point). See the following website for more information <http://www.elsevier.com/highlights>

Graphical Abstract (optional)

Graphical Abstracts should summarize the contents of the article in a concise, pictorial form designed to capture the attention of a wide readership online. Refer to the following website for more information: <http://www.elsevier.com/graphicalabstracts>

Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering features the Interactive Plot Viewer, see: <http://www.elsevier.com/interactiveplots>. Interactive Plots provide easy access to the data behind plots. To include one with your article, please prepare a .csv file with your plot data and test it online at <http://authortools.elsevier.com/interactiveplots/verification> before submission as supplementary material.

MethodsX file (optional)

If you have customized (a) research method(s) for the project presented in your Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering article, you are invited to submit this part of your work as MethodsX article alongside your revised research article. MethodsX is an independent journal that publishes the work you have done to develop research methods to your specific needs or setting. This is an opportunity to get full credit for the time and money you may have spent on developing research methods, and to increase the visibility and impact of your work.

How does it work?

- 1) Fill in the MethodsX article template: <https://www.elsevier.com/MethodsX-template>
- 2) Place all MethodsX files (including graphical abstract, figures and other relevant files) into a .zip file and upload this as a 'Method Details (MethodsX)' item alongside your revised Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering manuscript. Please ensure all of your relevant MethodsX documents are zipped into a single file.
- 3) If your Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering research article is accepted, your MethodsX article will automatically be transferred to MethodsX, where it will be reviewed and published as a separate article upon acceptance. MethodsX is a fully Open Access journal, the publication fee is only 520 US\$.

Questions? Please contact the MethodsX team at methodsx@elsevier.com. Example MethodsX articles can be found here: <http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/journal/22150161>

Include interactive data visualizations in your publication and let your readers interact and engage more closely with your research. Follow the instructions here: <https://www.elsevier.com/authors/author-services/data-visualization> to find out about available data visualization options and how to include them with your article.

MethodsX file (optional)

We invite you to submit a method article alongside your research article. This is an opportunity to get full credit for the time and money you have spent on developing research methods, and to increase the visibility and impact of your work. If your research article is accepted, your method article will be automatically transferred over to the open access journal, MethodsX, where it will be editorially reviewed and published as a separate method article upon acceptance. Both articles will be linked on ScienceDirect. Please use the MethodsX template available here when preparing your article: <https://www.elsevier.com/MethodsX-template>. Open access fees apply.

I look forward to receiving your revised manuscript.

Yours sincerely,

Apostolos Giannis, Ph.D
Associate Editor
Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering

Data in Brief (optional):

We invite you to convert your supplementary data (or a part of it) into an additional journal publication in Data in Brief, a multi-disciplinary open access journal. Data in Brief articles are a fantastic way to describe supplementary data and associated metadata, or full raw datasets deposited in an external repository, which are otherwise unnoticed. A Data in Brief article (which will be reviewed, formatted, indexed, and given a DOI) will make your data easier to find, reproduce, and cite.

You can submit to Data in Brief when you upload your revised manuscript. To do so, complete the template and follow the co-submission instructions found here: www.elsevier.com/dib-template. If your manuscript is accepted, your Data in Brief submission will automatically be transferred to Data in Brief for editorial review and publication.

Please note: an open access Article Publication Charge (APC) is payable by the author or research funder to cover the costs associated with publication in Data in Brief and ensure your data article is immediately and permanently free to access by all. For the current APC see: www.elsevier.com/journals/data-in-brief/2352-3409/open-access-journal

Please contact the Data in Brief editorial office at dib-me@elsevier.com or visit the Data in Brief homepage (www.journals.elsevier.com/data-in-brief/) if you have questions or need further information.

MethodsX (optional)

We invite you to submit a method article alongside your research article. This is an opportunity to get full credit for the time and money spent on developing research methods, and to increase the visibility and impact of your work. If your research article is accepted, we will contact you with instructions on the submission process for your method article to MethodsX. On receipt at MethodsX it will be editorially reviewed and, upon acceptance, published as a separate method article. Your articles will be linked on ScienceDirect.

Please prepare your paper using the MethodsX Guide for Authors: <https://www.elsevier.com/journals/methodsx/2215-0161/guide-for-authors> (and template available here: <https://www.elsevier.com/MethodsX-template>) Open access fees apply.

Editor comments:

The authors should clearly address the removal (%) of RhB by adsorption and degradation. Which process is more efficient? Is any synergistic effect by the structured material? What are the degradation products? The mechanism should be further elaborated.

Reviewers' comments:

Reviewer #1: This work fabricated a novel hollow mesoporous magnetite to remove RhB from the aqueous solution via the simultaneous adsorption and degradation. Some interesting and significant works carried out in this work. However, this manuscript suffers from some shortcomings. And many improvements should be made before the paper meets the requirement for publication.

The authors should pay more attention on the following points.

- (1) More work is needed to improve the level of English throughout the entire manuscript.
- (2) More detailed degradation mechanisms needed to be investigated, such as what were the active species for degrading RhB? What intermediate products were produced during the degradation process?
- (3) In this work, a spectrophotometer was employed to analyze the concentration change of RhB? How to confirm the full mineralization for RhB? TOC analysis results needed to be provided for confirming the full mineralization.
- (4) What was the role of adsorption and degradation on the RhB removal? Which process played a major role?
- (5) Would Fe element be dissolved out during the process? The multiple replicates of RhB removal experiments should be carried out?
- (6) Error bars should to be added into Figures 5, 6 and 7.
- (7) In Figure 6, What was the pH?
- (8) Was it appropriate to use adsorption models such as BET or Langmuir to describe RhB removal in the presence of degradation reactions?

(9) Some comparison between the results in this work and those reported in literatures should be added.

Reviewer #2: This work reported the synthesis of a hollow mesoporous magnetite templated by polystyrene. The hollow structure was obviously seen by TEM image. The adsorption and degradation for RhB dye were also investigated in detail. Overall, this work is meaningful and well organized. I will suggest its publication. However, before that, several confusing issues may be advised.

1. The hollow structure was obtained after the calcination process. I wonder if this hollow Fe₃O₄ can remain in water, acid or base solution. If that, what is the main connection mode (or interaction) between adjacent Fe₃O₄ particles? Please give the direct proofs.
2. A comparison with the non-hollow Fe₃O₄ must be performed to demonstrate your idea.
3. The ΔH reached to 1087300 kJ/mol in Table 3. The value is so unbelievable. Please explain it carefully.
4. Some Refs. about RhB adsorption are advised. e.g. J. Chem. Eng. Data 2021, 66, 669–676; Journal of Colloid and Interface Science 525 (2018) 39-47

Reviewer #3: The specific comments are as follows:

1. I do not think that this study provides an advance in the academy. There are many papers talking about that, it is being declined for lack of sufficient novelty.
3. The "Novelty Statement" is very common.
4. Introduction: It needs to be addressed what the originality or novelty of the present work is in comparison with these previous work.
5. The main findings should be discussed with more details to elaborate what's new or different in this research.
6. Are there any duplicate runs for the analysis? If not, without duplicate runs, it is hard to identify whether the variations are coming from random error or something else.
7. Give more detail on the number of samples, replications.
8. The authors should compare/discuss the finding to other works. Results and Discussion: For our concerning as a reader, we didn't find out clearly results. The authors should compare/discuss the finding to other works. To be frank, the not enough explanation and scientific reasoning especially topic 3.7 mechanism, undermine the whole quality and relevant conclusion of this manuscript, lack of evidences to support these discussions.

Reviewer #4: The research article entitled " POLYSTYRENE-TEMPLATED HOLLOW MESOPOROUS MAGNETITE AS A BIFUNCTIONAL ADSORBENT FOR THE REMOVAL OF RHODAMINE B VIA SIMULTANEOUS ADSORPTION AND DEGRADATION" is interesting with some novelty.

However, major points must be improved before publication.

The authors have to address the following points:

- The significant figures of numbers must be corrected
- Too much keywords in this paper.
- Many high performance adsorbents for dye removal should be introduced

The author should refer some papers:

Environmental Science and Pollution Research volume 29, pages22576-22588 (2022); Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering 9 (2), 105135 (2021); Journal of Molecular Liquids 301, 112456 (2020)

- The last paragraph should emphasize the novelty of this work.
- Is the synthesis procedure licensed by the authors.

If not, appropriate references are needed.

- The characterization methods should be in more details.

The change in surface charge should evaluated by zeta potential measurement

- EDX mapping is not clear.
- Did the authors conduct in replicates.

If yes, please show the standard deviations

- Adsorption isotherms need more discussion.
- Adsorption mechanisms are not clear.

- Comparison between this material and other published ones is needed.

-

Please note that the editorial process varies considerably from journal to journal. To view the submission-to-publication lifecycle, click here: http://help.elsevier.com/app/answers/detail/p/7923/a_id/160

For further assistance, please visit our customer support site at <http://help.elsevier.com/app/answers/list/p/7923>. Here you can search for solutions on a range of topics, find answers to frequently asked questions and learn more about EM via interactive tutorials. You will also find our 24/7 support contact details should you need any further assistance from one of our customer support representatives.

#AU_JECE#

To ensure this email reaches the intended recipient, please do not delete the above code

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/jece/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.



Maria Yuliana <mariayuliana@ukwms.ac.id>

Submission Confirmation for JECE-D-22-04236R1

1 message

Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering <em@editorialmanager.com>
Reply-To: Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering <support@elsevier.com>
To: Maria Yuliana <mariayuliana@ukwms.ac.id>

Fri, Jun 17, 2022 at 5:23 PM

Ms. Ref. No.: JECE-D-22-04236R1

Title: POLYSTYRENE-TEMPLATED HOLLOW MESOPOROUS MAGNETITE AS A BIFUNCTIONAL ADSORBENT FOR THE REMOVAL OF RHODAMINE B VIA SIMULTANEOUS ADSORPTION AND DEGRADATION

Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering
Research Paper

Dear Dr. Maria Yuliana,

This message is to acknowledge that we have received your revised manuscript for reconsideration for publication in Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering.

You may check the status of your manuscript by logging into the Editorial Manager as an author at <https://www.editorialmanager.com/jece/>.

Thank you for submitting your work to Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering.

Kind regards,

Editorial Manager
Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering

For further assistance, please visit our customer support site at <http://help.elsevier.com/app/answers/list/p/7923>. Here you can search for solutions on a range of topics, find answers to frequently asked questions and learn more about EM via interactive tutorials. You will also find our 24/7 support contact details should you need any further assistance from one of our customer support representatives.

#AU_JECE#

To ensure this email reaches the intended recipient, please do not delete the above code

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/jece/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.



Maria Yuliana <mariayuliana@ukwms.ac.id>

Your Submission - JECE-D-22-04236R1

2 messages

Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering <em@editorialmanager.com>
Reply-To: Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering <support@elsevier.com>
To: Maria Yuliana <mariayuliana@ukwms.ac.id>

Wed, Jun 29, 2022 at 4:58 PM

Ms. Ref. No.: JECE-D-22-04236R1

Title: POLYSTYRENE-TEMPLATED HOLLOW MESOPOROUS MAGNETITE AS A BIFUNCTIONAL ADSORBENT FOR THE REMOVAL OF RHODAMINE B VIA SIMULTANEOUS ADSORPTION AND DEGRADATION
Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering

Dear Dr. Yuliana,

I am pleased to inform you that your manuscript "POLYSTYRENE-TEMPLATED HOLLOW MESOPOROUS MAGNETITE AS A BIFUNCTIONAL ADSORBENT FOR THE REMOVAL OF RHODAMINE B VIA SIMULTANEOUS ADSORPTION AND DEGRADATION" has been accepted for publication in Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering.

Below are comments from the editor and reviewers.

Once your paper is entered in our Production system, we aim to provide you with a typeset proof within 24 hours.

Thank you for submitting your work to Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering.

Your accepted manuscript will now be transferred to our production department and work will begin on creation of the proof. If we need any additional information to create the proof, we will let you know. If not, you will be contacted again in the next few days with a request to approve the proof and to complete a number of online forms that are required for publication.

Yours sincerely,

Apostolos Giannis, Ph.D
Associate Editor
Journal of Environmental Chemical Engineering

Comments from the editors and reviewers:

Reviewer #1: The authors have responded to the comments of reviewers one by one in detail. After a lot of efforts made by the authors, the manuscript has been greatly improved and its current status is suitable for publication in this journal.

Reviewer #2: After the careful revision, I suggest its publication.

Reviewer #3: After careful reconsideration of the present revised version of the manuscript no. JECE-D-22-04236R1, I believe authors have made almost all of the requested comments and changes on the manuscript. Therefore, I am pleased to recommend the current well-improved version for publication in this high prestigious: JECE.

For further assistance, please visit our customer support site at <http://help.elsevier.com/app/answers/list/p/7923>. Here you can search for solutions on a range of topics, find answers to frequently asked questions and learn more about EM via interactive tutorials. You will also find our 24/7 support contact details should you need any further assistance from one of

our customer support representatives.

#AU_JECE#

To ensure this email reaches the intended recipient, please do not delete the above code

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/jece/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Maria Yuliana <mariayuliana@ukwms.ac.id>

Wed, Jul 6, 2022 at 3:06 PM

To: Richky Wijaya <richkywijayaa@gmail.com>, richky wijaya <richky.abadi.wijaya@gmail.com>, Carlos Marcelinos <marcelinocarlos09@gmail.com>

Best regards,

Ir. Maria Yuliana, S.T., Ph.D., IPM.

Asst. Professor - International Bachelor Program Coordinator

Chemical Engineering Department - Faculty of Engineering

Widya Mandala Surabaya Catholic University

Kalijudan 37, Surabaya 60114, Indonesia

Tel. 62 31 3891264 ext 112; **Mobile.** 62 81 330 563 170; **Fax.** 62 31 3891267

E-mail. mariayuliana@ukwms.ac.id | **Web.** <https://www.chemeng.ukwms.ac.id/>

Profile. [Publons](#) | [Researchgate](#) | [LinkedIn](#) | [Instagram](#)

[Quoted text hidden]