

CHAPTER V

CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTIONS

In this chapter, writer explains about conclusion and suggestions. On the conclusion the writer concludes the findings of this study that the writer has explained before in the previous chapter. The writer also gives some suggestions to English teachers and the further studies which want to administer similar research like the writer.

5.1. Conclusion

Reading is one of important skill in order to master English. There are many techniques that can be used for teaching reading. However, using good technique for teaching reading might improve students' reading ability better. Thus, the writer conducted this study to compare the effect phonics instruction and whole language instruction on the students' reading accuracy. This study was applied quasi-experimental pretest-posttest non-equivalent control group design.

The writer took three classes out three classes as the subjects in this study by using *Anova: Single Factor* to prove they did not have significantly different in their reading accuracy ability. Then, the writer randomly chose three classes to be pilot group, experimental group and control group. The experimental group was taught using phonics instruction while control group was taught using whole language instruction. Next, the writer tried out the instrument in the pilot group; after the pretest was ready the writer performed

the pretest into both experimental and control group. After that, three times treatments were conducted to experimental and control group and the data collection was closed by giving posttest. The posttest which was given was exactly the same with the pretest given before.

In order to answer the research question of this study whether there is significant difference or not on the reading accuracy of second grade elementary students who are taught phonics instruction and those who are taught whole language instruction. The writer calculated the gain scores both groups (experimental and control group) using computerized *t-Test: Two-Sample Assuming Unequal Variances* with level of significance 0.05.

Then, the writer found that t-stat was 0.490 which was lower than t-critical two-tail (2.014). It can concluded that there is no significant difference on the reading accuracy of second graders who are taught phonics instruction and those who are taught whole language instruction.

5.2. Suggestions

➤ For English Teachers

Although whole language instruction has greater mean score, it is proved that phonics instruction effective improves students' reading accuracy (see **table 4.2 pg 41**). The teachers might use phonics instruction as alternative teaching reading technique, so the teachers have variations technique in teaching reading. The teachers could combine whole language and phonics instruction in their teaching and learning process.

Based on the writer's observation during treatments, phonics instruction or whole language instruction should be combined with any games thus the students will enjoy studying reading.

➤ **For Further Studies**

According to the writer's observation and experience, the first suggestion for the next study was about the time allocation. The writer faced too many gaps between pretest and the first treatments and between the first and second treatment because there were national holidays and teacher's condition so the treatment had to be cancelled. As well as the English subject for second graders in the school only once a week. The students might forget about the materials had given before.

The second suggestion is about the treatments. Because of limited time and teacher's condition the writer only conducted three times treatments and it was not enough especially when dealing with young learners. The teacher will need more time to handle the students. It is better for the further studies to conduct more than three treatments. The further studies could administer the treatments more than three times as the writer had done in this research in order to get valid result.

Bibliography:

- Adams, J. M. (1990). *Beginning to Read: Thinking and Learning about Print*. London, England: Massachusetts Institute of Technology.
- Bergeron, S. B. (1990). *What Does the Term Whole Language Mean? Constructing a Definition from the Literature*. Retrieved in May 17, 2016 from <http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/10862969009547716>
- Bergeron, S. B. & Wolff-B, M. (2002). *The Reading Strategies in the Primary Grades*. U.S.A.: Scholastic Professional Books. Retrieved in June 11, 2016 from <http://bpsassets.weebly.com/uploads/9/9/3/2/9932784/readingstrategies.pdf>
- Chall, J. S. (1967). *Learning to Read: The Great Debate*. Retrieved in June 15, 2016 from <http://www.weber.edu/wsuiimages/jmitchell/MEDUC%206355/The%20Great%20Debate.pdf>
- Chall, J. S. (1983). *Stages of Reading Development*. U.S.A.: McGraw-Hill Book Company.
- Charles, R. (Writer), & Herman, T. (Illustrator). Chip the Chimp [Decodable Book 47]. Retrieved on January 5, 2017 from <https://www.readinga-z.com/book.php?id=359>
- Charles, R. (Writer), & Nordin, S. (Illustrator). Thad and Thelma [Decodable Book 50] Retrieved on January 5, 2017 from <https://www.readinga-z.com/book.php?id=360>
- Children Learning Centre [Graphic]. Retrieved on July 4, 2016 from <http://www.thelearningcottage.info/IMAGES/art2.jpg>. Columbia: The Learning Cottage
- Connelly, V., Rhona, Johnston., & G. Brian T. (2001). *The effect of phonics instruction on reading comprehension of beginning readers*. Retrieved in August 11, 2016 from https://www.academia.edu/3108243/The_effect_of_phonics_instruction_on_the_reading_comprehension_of_beginningreaders
- Cotter, J. (2011). *Understanding the Relationship between Reading Fluency and Reading Comprehension: Fluency Strategies as a Focus for Instruction*. Retrieved in June 9, 2017 from http://fisherpub.sjfc.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1225&context=education_ETD_masters
- Dixon J. & Tuladhar S. (1996). *Whole Language Action-Learning Manual*. U.S.A.: Literacy Linkage Program. Retrieved in June 20, 2016 from

http://scholarworks.umass.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1003&context=cie_actionlearningmanual

- Hay, J. & Wingo E. C. (1954). *Teacher's Manual for Reading with Phonics*. Revised. Teacher Edition. U.S.A.: J. B. Lippincott Company.
- Heilman, W. A. (2002). *Phonics in Proper Perspective*. 9th Edition. U.S.A.: Merrill Prentice Hall.
- Hill, R. D. (2001). Survey: Graded Readers. Retrieved in June 11, 2016 from <http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.473.2573&rep=rep1&type=pdf>
- Hurd, Clement (Illustrator). (1975). *GoodNight Moon* [Book Cover]. U.S.: HarperFestival.
- Heather (Illustrator). (2011). *Phonics Flashcards* [Graphic]. Retrieved on June 11, 2016 from <http://dollarstoremom.com/2011/04/make-a-phonics-flip-chart/>
- Kemampuan Membaca Anak Indonesia Masih Rendah*. (2009, October 28). Retrieved October 31, 2016, from <http://edukasi.kompas.com/read/2009/10/28/21513448/%7C>
- Linse, C. (2006). *Practical English Teaching: Young Learners*. New York: McGraw-Hill.
- Liu, K. C. *Phonics: Theory and Practice*. Retrieved in August 11, 2016 from <http://web.ntpu.edu.tw/~language/workshop/phonics.pdf>
- Maddox K. & Jay F. (2013). *Whole Language vs Phonic Instruction: Effect on Reading Fluency and Spelling Accuracy of First Grade Students*. Retrieved in August 11, 2016 from <https://eric.ed.gov/?id=ED545621>
- Maurer, A. (2011). *Reading Fluency: Speed, Accuracy, Expression, Oh My!* Scholastic. Retrieved in July 9, 2016 from <https://www.scholastic.com/teachers/blog-posts/andrea-spillett/speed-accuracy-expression-oh-my/>
- Moats, L.C. (2001). *Speech to Print: Language Essentials for Teachers*. Baltimore, MD: Paul H. Bookes.
- Mohamad, A. *Kemampuan Membaca Bangsa Indonesia Urutan 60 di Dunia*. (2016, April 21) Retrieved on October 31, 2016, from <https://www.merdeka.com/dunia/kemampuan-membaca-bangsa-indonesia-urutan-60-dunia.html>
- Optiz, M. (1995). *Getting the Most from Predictable Books: Strategies and Activities for Teaching with More than 75 Children's Book*. New York: Scholastic Book Services.

Print Rich Environment [Graphic]. Retrieved on July 4, 2016 from
http://www.kidskidscastlehills.com/common/media/249images/194_1743259834.jpg

Serna, S. C. (2006). *The Role of Phonemic Awareness and Phonics in Beginning Reading*. Journal of Adventists Education. Retrieved in May 16, 2016 from <http://circle.adventist.org/files/jae/en/jae200668042606.pdf>

Whole Language Teaching Method. Retrieved on Thursday, Dec 15 2016 from:
<http://www.childrens-books-and-reading.com/whole-language.html>