

CHAPTER 5

CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTION

This chapter presents the conclusion of the study deals with principal's leadership styles toward teachers' job satisfaction and teachers' intention to leave presented in Chapter 4 and some suggestions for pedagogical purposes and future research.

5.1. Conclusion

After analyzing and categorizing the data, the writer summarizes some points. First, it deals with the principal leadership styles. The second deals with the teachers' job satisfaction and the third deals with the teachers' intention to leave.

The first research question is related to the leadership styles practiced by the principal of Joy English. From the collected data of questionnaire and interview, it is found that the principal of Joy English tends to possess four traits of transformational leadership. First, she is distinguished by her capacity to inspire and provide individualized consideration, intellectual stimulation and idealized influence to her subordinates. Second, she creates learning opportunities for her subordinates; motivate and stimulate them to solve problems. Third, she possesses great visioning, rhetorical and management skills to develop strong emotional bonds with subordinates. At last, she always looks for adaptive solutions to engage hearts and minds in the change process.

Second research question is on how the principal's leadership style affects teachers' job satisfaction. Among five teachers, two feels satisfied supervised by the principal. However, three of them do not feel the same. They do not feel comfortable working with the principal and being led by

her. Supervision, individual personality characteristics, and effective communication play significant roles for job satisfaction and also transformational leadership. One of teachers felt that principal supervised her too much. This is caused by different individual personality characteristics of teachers that lead them perceived the principal's supervision differently. Other teachers felt that the way principal forms a decision put them in unpleasant situation as principal puts customers over teachers. The principal's decision is done for the growth and sustainability of the Joy English. However, the effective communication does not work well so that teachers do not see the same way as the principal does. Thus, teachers do not feel satisfied toward her principal's leadership styles although the principal owns transformational leadership styles.

In accordance with the teachers' job satisfaction, three of five teachers plan not to work longer in Joy English, dealing with the way principal leads them. This answers the third research question on how leadership styles affect teachers' intention to leave. They also have input for the principal's leadership style because they think the principal's leadership styles need to be improved.

To conclude, through the exploratory study on principal's leadership styles of Joy English, the transformational leadership does not bring positive impact on teachers' job satisfaction. Instead, it increases teachers' intention to leave. Supervision, individual personality characteristics, and effective communication affect the teachers' satisfaction and their intention to leave.

It is proven from teachers' response toward things they dislike about the principal (see Appendix 2-Q11). Transformational leader tends to encourage, motivate and give suggestions. However, the principal of Joy English give suggestions that are impossible to do and her decision mostly

put teachers in an unpleasant situation as stated by T2 and T4. Two teachers even talking about her being unfair in treating teachers and the principal puts parents over teachers. Thus, teachers felt less appreciated (see Appendix 2–Q17) or dissatisfied on their job and intended to leave.

5.2. Suggestions

Based on the findings of this study, the writer suggests that a good transformational leadership should emphasize more on the effective communication, especially in envisioning subordinates. Leader should embrace the opportunities without leaving the subordinates behind.

One suggestion for the principal of Joy English, since transformational should happen within the whole organization, considering teachers' suggestions is the must-thing to do. Listening to their opinion and giving them factual suggestions are two ways that the principal can do to minimize teachers' dissatisfaction and their intention to leave. By giving more reliable suggestions, they can perform better and perceive better job satisfaction.

Besides, other critics are opposed toward salary. Teachers who intend to leave stated that salary also plays an important consideration for them. This should be put into a consideration as subordinates' wealth may affect their performance and job satisfaction. As one teacher said, when she was well paid, she dared to give more than the principal deserved.

For the further study, the writer suggests that the concern of the study will be broader than this study as the writer only concern on the teachers' job satisfaction and intention to leave. Therefore, for the future study it is expected that the study will put more variables as the determining factors of leadership, such as teachers' perception toward job and their performance.

Another suggestion deals with the subject of the study. In this study the writer chooses only one principal to be examined. Thus, the future study should take more than one principal to be explored and examined for a better result.

Those are all the suggestions for a better future study on the effect of principal's leadership styles toward teachers' job satisfaction and intention to leave.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Adams, J. S. (1965). Inequity in social exchange. *Advances in experimental social psychology*, 2, 267-299.
- Albaugh, J. (2003). Keeping nurses in nursing: the profession's challenge for today. *Urologic Nursing*, 23, 193-199.
- Altunoğlu, Ali Ender and Pinar Sarpkaya. (2012). Effects of Burnout and Job Satisfaction on Intention to Leave. *African Journal of Business Management Vol. 6(29)*, 8564-8571
- Avolio, B. J. (2007). Promoting more integrative strategies for leadership theory building. *American Psychologist*, 62, 25–33.
- Barmby, P. (2006). Improving teacher recruitment and retention: the importance of workload and pupil behaviour. *Educational research*, 48(3), 247-265.
- Bass, B. M. (2008). *The Bass handbook of leadership: Theory, research, & managerial applications* (4th ed.). New York, NY: Free Press.
- Bhatti, N., Maitlo, G. M., Shaikh, N., Hashmi, M. A., & Shaikh, F. M. (2012). The impact of autocratic and democratic leadership style on job satisfaction. *International Business Research*, 5(2), 192.
- Blanchard, K. H. (2010). *Leading at a higher level: Blanchard on leadership and creating high performing organizations*. FT Press
- Blanchard, K., & Miller, M. (2014). *The secret: what great leaders know and do*. Berrett-Koehler Publishers.
- Bogler, Ronit. (2001). The Influence of Leadership Style on Teacher Job Satisfaction. *Educational Administration Quarterly Vol. 37(5)*, 662-683.
- Brown, M., Hohenshil, T.H., & Brown, D. (1998). School Psychologists' job satisfaction in the USA: A national study. *School Psychology International Journal*, 19(1), 79-89.
- Burns, J. M. (1978). *Leadership*. New York: Harper & Row.

- Charmaz, K., & Belgrave, L. (2006). Qualitative interviewing and grounded theory analysis. *The SAGE handbook of interview research: The complexity of the craft*, 2, 2002.
- Chiang, C. F., & Wang, Y. Y. (2011). The effects of transactional and transformational leadership on organizational commitment in hotels: The mediating effect of trust. *Journal of Hotel & Business Management*, 2012.
- Chirchir, R. K., & Ngeno, A. K. W. K. V. (2014). Leadership style and teachers commitment in public primary schools in Bomet County, Kenya. *Leadership*, 5(39).
- Clandinin, D. J., & Connelly, F. M. (2000). *Narrative inquiry: Experience and story in qualitative research*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, Inc.
- Clark, Donald Jay. (2009). The Impact of Leadership and Culture on Student Achievement: A Case Study of a Successful Rural School District. *UNLV Theses/Dissertations/ Professional Papers/Capstones*.
- Corbin, J., & Strauss, A. (2007). *Basics of qualitative research: Techniques and procedures for developing grounded theory*. Sage publications.
- Cowin, L. (2002). *The Self-Concept of Nurses and its Relationship to Job Satisfaction and Retention*. Unpublished PhD thesis. The University of Western Sydney, Australia.
- Cropanzano, R., James, K., & Citera, M. (1993). A goal hierarchy model of personality, motivation, and leadership. *Research in organizational behavior*, 15, 267-267.
- Dalton, D. R., Krackhardt, D. M., & Porter, L. W. (1981). Functional Turnover: An Empirical Assessment. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 66(6), 716.
- Denzin, Norman K. & Lincoln, Yvonna S. (Eds.). (2005). *The Sage Handbook of Qualitative Research (3rd ed.)*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

- Dinham, S., & Scott, C. (1998). A Three Domain Model of Teacher and School Executive Career Satisfaction. *Journal of Educational Administration*, 36(4), 362-378.
- Dodd-McCue, D., & Wright, G. B. (1996). Men, women, and attitudinal commitment: The effects of workplace experiences and socialization. *Human Relations*, 49, 1065-1089.
- Dollarhide, C., Gibson, D., & Saginak, K. (2008). New counselors' leadership efforts in school counseling: Themes from a year-long qualitative study. *Professional School Counseling*, 11(4), 262-271.
- Dubrin, A., J. (2007). *Leadership research findings, practice, and skills*. 5th edition, Houghton Mifflin Company.
- Fetterman, D. M. (Ed.). (2010). *Ethnography: Step-by-step* (Vol. 17). Sage.
- Goddard, R., & O'Brien, P. (2003). *Beginning teachers' perceptions of their work, well-being, and intention to leave* (Doctoral dissertation, Taylor & Francis (Routledge)).
- Greenfield, T., & Ribbins, P. (1993). *Greenfield on educational administration: Towards a humane science*.
- Greenleaf, R. K. (1970). *The Servant as Leader*, The Robert K. Greenleaf Center, Indianapolis, IN.
- Heller, H.W., Clay, R. & Perkins, C. (1993). The Relationship Between Teacher Job Satisfaction and Principal Leadership Style. *Journal of School Leadership*, 3(1), 74-86.
- Hersey, P. & Blanchard, K.H. (1976). *Situational Leadership*. Columbus: Ohio State University, Center for Leadership Studies.
- Johnsrud, L., and Rosser, V.J. (2002). Faculty members' morale and their intention to leave: A multi-level explanation. *The Journal of Higher Education*, 73(4): 518-542.
- Kemendikbud. (2016). Retrieved from <http://dapo.dikmen.kemdikbud.go.id/portal/web/> on Sunday, 6 March 2016.

- Knani, M. and Fournier, P.S. (2013) Burnout, Job Characteristics, and Intent to Leave: Does Work Experience Have Any Effect. *Journal of Emerging Trends in Economics and Management Sciences*, 4, 403-408.
- Lee, R. T., & Ashforth, B. E. (1996). A meta-analytic examination of the correlates of the three dimensions of job burnout. *Journal of applied Psychology*, 81(2), 123.
- Lee, T. W., & Mowday, R. T. 1987. Voluntary leaving of organization: An empirical investigation of Steers and Mowday's model of turnover. *Academy of Management Journal*, 30: 721-743.
- Lewin, K., Lippitt, R., & White, R. K. (1939). Patterns of aggressive behavior in experimentally created "social climates". *The Journal of social psychology*, 10(2), 269-299.
- Lofland, J. and L. H. Lofland (1995). *Analyzing Social Settings: a guide to qualitative observation and analysis*. Belmont, CA: Wadsworth Publishing Company.
- MacKenzie, S. B., Podsakoff, P. M., & Rich, G. A. (2001). Transformational and transactional leadership and salesperson performance. *Journal of the academy of Marketing Science*, 29(2), 115-134.
- Marshall, C. and Rossman, G. B. (2006). *Designing Qualitative Research*. (4th ed.). Sage Publication.
- Martin, U., & Schinke, S. P. (1998). Organizational and individual factors influencing job satisfaction and burnout of mental health workers. *Social Work in Health Care*, 28,(2), 51-62.
- Martinez-Ponz, M. (1990). *Test of a three-factor model of teacher commitment*. Paper presented at the annual conference of the New England Educational Research Organization, Maine.
- Maynard, M. (1986). Measuring work and support network satisfaction. *Journal of Employment Counseling*, 23(1), 9-19.

- McCleskey J. (2014). Situational, Transformational, and Transactional Leadership and Leadership Development. *Journal of Business Studies Quarterly*, vol. 5, no 2, pp. 117-130.
- MOEC. (2012). *Indonesia Educational Statistics In Brief*. Jakarta: Ministry of Education and Culture (MOEC).
- Moustakas, C. (1994). *Phenomenological research methods*. Sage Publications.
- Muijs, D., & Harris, A. (2007). Teacher leadership in (In) action three case studies of contrasting schools. *Educational management administration & leadership*, 35(1), 111-134.
- Northouse, Peter G. (2001). *Leadership Theory and Practice*, 2nd edition. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, Inc.
- O'Driscoll, M.P. and Randall, D.M. (1999), "Perceived organizational support, satisfaction with rewards, and employee job involvement and organizational commitment", *Applied Psychology: An Interview Review*, Vol. 48 No. 2, pp. 197-209.
- Oyetunji, C.O. (2006). *The Relationship between Leadership Style and School Climate in Botswana Secondary Schools PhD thesis*.
- Padgett, D. K. (2008). *Qualitative methods in social work research* (Vol. 36). Sage.
- Podsakoff, P. M., MacKenzie, S. B., Moorman, R. H., & Fetter, R. (1990). Transformational leader behaviors and their effects on followers' trust in leader, satisfaction, and organizational citizenship behaviors. *The leadership quarterly*, 1(2), 107-142.
- Purani, K., & Sahadev, S. (2007). The moderating role of industrial experience in the job satisfaction, intention to leave relationship: an empirical study among salesmen in India. *Journal of Business & Industrial Marketing*, 23(7), 475-485.
- Ridder, H. G., & Yin, R. K. (2012). *Case Study Research: Design and Methods 4 th ed*.

- Reyes, P.; Madsen, J.; & Taylor, B. (1989). *Organizational incentives, teacher commitment, morale, and job satisfaction: Is the program achieving its goals?* Paper presented at the annual meeting of American Education Research Association, San Francisco, CA.
- Robbins, SP. & Coulter, M. (2005). *Management*. Pearson Education. Inc; and Dorling Kindersley Publishing Inc, India.
- Schroffel, A. (1999). *How does clinical supervision affect job satisfaction?* *The Clinical Supervisor*, 18, (2), 91-105.
- Schultz, T. W., & Schultz, T. W. (1982). *Investing in people: The economics of population quality*. Univ of California Press.
- Siegel, L., & Lance, I. M. (1987). *Personnel and organizational psychology*. RD Irwin.
- Smith, P. C., Kendall, L. M., & Hulin, C. L. (1969). *The measurement of satisfaction in work and retirement*. Chicago: Rand McNally.
- Spears, L. C. (2005). The Understanding and Practice of Servant Leadership. *Servant Leadership Research Roundtable*. Regent University.
- Stake, R. E. (1995). *The Art of Case Study Research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Strauss, Anselm; Corbin, Juliet (1998). *Basics of Qualitative Research Techniques and Procedures for Developing Grounded Theory* (2nd edition). Sage Publications: London.
- Sternberg, R. J. (2007). Finding students who are wise, practical, and creative. *The Chronicle of Higher Education*, 53(44), B11.
- Sushanta, K. R., (2012). Practice and Problems of Principals 'Leadership Style and Teachers' Job Performance in Secondary Schools of Ethiopia of Educational Planning & Management, Bahir Dar University, Ethiopia. *An international multidisciplinary peer reviewed journal*. ISSN 2278-120X.

- Warrilow, S. (2012). *Transformational Leadership Theory: The 4 Key Components in Leading Change & Managing Change*. Retrieved from http://EzineArticles.com/?expert=Stephen_Warrilow on Sunday, 6 March 2016
- Wasserberg, M. (1999). Creating the vision and making it happen. *Living headship: Voices, values and vision*, 154-165.
- Waters, T. J., & Marzano, R. J. (2006). School District Leadership That Works: The Effect of Superintendent Leadership on Student Achievement. *A Working Paper. Mid-Continent Research for Education and Learning (McREL)*.
- Wetherell, K. M. (2002). Principal Leadership Style and Teacher Job Datisfaction. *Seton Hall University Dissertations and Theses (ETDs)*.
- Wexley, K., and Yukl, G. (1984). *Organizational Behavior and Personnel Psychology*. Homewood, IL: Richard D. Irwin
- Wolcott Harry, F. (2008). *Ethnography: A Way of Seeing*. Lanham: Altamira Press.
- Wong, K. C., & Li, K. K. (1995). Teacher Turnover and Turnover Intentions in Hong Kong Aided Secondary Schools. *Educational Research Journal*, 10(1), 36-46.
- Wood, V. R., Chonko, L. B., & Hunt, S. D. (1986). Social Responsibility and Personal Success: Are They Incompatible?. *Journal of Business Research*, 14(3), 193-212.
- Worrell, T.G. (2004). *School Psychologists' Job Satisfaction: Ten Years Later*. A PhD Dissertation submitted to the faculty of the Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University.
- Wote, P. E. (2014). *Comparative Study On Leadership Styles Practiced in Private and Government Secondary Schools. The Case of East Badawacho District*. Hadya Zone, SNNPR, MA Thesis, Haramaya University.

- Yin, R. K. (2009). *Case study research: Design and methods 4th ed.* In *United States: Library of Congress Cataloguing-in-Publication Data.*
- Yukl, G. (1999). An evaluation of conceptual weaknesses in transformational and charismatic leadership theories. *The leadership quarterly*, 10(2), 285-305.
- Yukl, G. A. (2002). *Leadership in Organizations.* (5th ed.). Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Yukl, G., & Mahsud, R. (2010). Why flexible and adaptive leadership is essential. *Consulting Psychology Journal: Practice and Research*, 62(2), 81-93.
- Vroom, V. H., & Jago, A. G. (2007). The role of the situation in leadership. *American Psychologist*, 62, 17-24.
- Zaccaro, S.J. (2007). Trait-based perspectives of leadership. *American Psychologist*, 62, 6-16.
- Zurn, P., Dolea, C., & Stilwell, B. (2005). *Nurse Retention and Recruitment: Developing a Motivated Workforce.* International Council of Nurses.